

**PROMOTING RURAL OPPORTUNITIES, GENERATING RESOURCES AND
ENCOURAGING SOCIAL SOLIDARITY IN KAYAH STATE (PROGRESS KAYAH)
PROJECT**

END OF PROJECT REVIEW

November – December 2008

Final Report

Version 3.0

Project Summary Sheet

Country	Myanmar
Project Title	Promoting Rural Opportunities, Generating Resources and Encouraging Social Solidarity In Kayah (PROGRESS Kayah)
Thematic Area	Food Security, Health Security, Social Network Security, Nutritional Security, Economic Security, Sustainable Agriculture, Water and Sanitation, Health Services and Social Mobilization
Total Project Budget in EUR	EUR 1,080,947. (revised EUR 1.060.472, 26)
EC Contribution	EUR 848.377,81
Other Co-donors	Government of Austria, EUR 57.483,21 MOFA Norway EUR 103,549 CARE Österreich EUR 51.062,24
Locality of Project	Loikaw, Demosoe Townships, Kayah State, Myanmar.
Target Population	4285 households (poor and marginalized internally displaced people HHs; priority is given to female-headed HHs)
Starting date	1 st July 2005
Project duration	Three and a half years
Name and address of the applicant organization	CARE Österreich Lange Casse 30/4 A-1080 Vienna, Austria Tel.: +43 (1) 715 0 715 Fax: +43 (1) 715 9 715 care@care.at
Contact Person of the applicant Organization	Mag. Barbara Winter Program Officer

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Acronyms/Abbreviations	4
Executive Summary	5
List of Recommendations	10
Main Report	
1. Purpose and Conduct of the Review	13
2. Situation Analysis	
2.1 Project Context	15
2.2 Project Location	15
2.3 Problem Analysis and Response	16
2.4 Validity of Assumptions	18
3. Project Achievements	
3.1 Overall Progress	20
3.2 Effectiveness of Project Strategies	21
3.3 Objectives	22
3.4 Expected Results	24
3.5 Project Management	36
4. Lessons Learned	38
Annexes	
A: Terms of Reference for the Review	
B: Review Methodology and Tool Kit	
C: Table of Project Achievements	
D: Map of Project Area	
E: Site Visit and Consultation Reports	
F: List of References and Documents Consulted	

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ACF	Action Contre La Faim
ARLPC	Assistant Rural Livelihoods Program Coordinator
CF	Community Facilitator
CKL	Catholic Karuna Loikaw
DAU	Demosoe Aid to the Uprooted
DPDC	District Peace and Development Council
EC	Commission of the European Communities
ECCD	Early Childhood Care and Development
EOPR	End Of Project Review
ER	Expected Result
ICDP	Integrated Community Development Project
IDP	Internally Displaced People
IEC	Information, Education, Communication
KBA	Kayah Baptist Association
KHB	Kay Htoe Boh
KMSS	Karuna Myanmar Social Services
KNPLF	Karenni Nationalities' Peoples Liberation Front
KPBA	Kayah Phu Baptist Association
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MSF	Medecins Sans Frontieres
MTR	Mid Term Review
NGO	Non Government Organization
ORS	Oral Rehydration Salts
PM	Project Manager
PO	Project Officer
PRA	Participatory Rural Appraisal
RLC	Rural Livelihoods Coordinator
SPDC	State Peace and Development Council
SPO	Senior Project Officer
TMC	Technical Management Committee
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNOPS	United Nations Office of Project Services
VDO	Village Development Organization
VHT	Village Health Team
VHV	Village Health Volunteer
VPDC	Village Peace and Development Council

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. Purpose and Conduct

In July 2005 the three-year *Promoting Rural Opportunities, Generating Resources and Encouraging Social Solidarity (PROGRESS)* Project commenced in Loikaw and Demosoe Townships, Kayah State, Myanmar. The project is funded by the European Commission and implemented by CARE. A Mid Term Review (MTR) in May/June 2007 made a number of recommendations, including for a non-cost extension (NCE) of six months. Therefore the project is scheduled for completion in December 2008. The purpose of the End of Project Review (EOPR) is to provide project accountability and to support continuous improvement for the donors and for CARE Myanmar, especially in relation to future projects. Specific objectives of the review include assessing the efficiency and effectiveness of the project, realizing the expected results and benefits, sustainability of activities, to generate lessons learned and develop recommendations to support the implementation of the new EC-supported Demosoe Aid to the Uprooted (DAU) project in Kayah¹.

2. Project Overview

Kayah State is one of the poorest and least accessible areas of Myanmar. Most of the population has been displaced at some time over the last two decades due to ongoing conflict, land degradation or drought. The project assisted over 4,365 households in 51 villages. The project is implemented in conjunction with four local partners/associates – Catholic Karuna Loikaw (CKL), Kay Htoe Boh (KHB), Kayah Baptist Association (KBA) and Kayahphu Baptist Association (KPBA). The project is designed to build capacity building in these project partners/associates as well as in village development organizations. Field implementation included a range of activities in agriculture, water supply and health. Villages were supported to obtain access to services and the project also provided mechanisms for strengthening relationships within and between communities, promoting collective approaches to problem solving and opportunities to reconcile different interests and support the reintegration of displaced people.

3. Project Achievements²

Overall Objective: To improve the livelihood security of poor and marginalised Internally Displaced People (IDP) households from different ethnic and religious groups in Kayah State, Myanmar

Specific Objective: At least 4285 households are empowered to collaboratively model, implement and replicate agriculture, water and health interventions that also encourage a secure enabling environment

The project has contributed to increasing the resilience and improving the livelihood security of over 4,365 IDP and other households in Kayah, through:

- Increasing agricultural productivity, for both staple and cash crops, from the introduction of improved varieties and technologies – for example, 86

¹ Terms of Reference for the EOPR are at Annex A. A full description of the EOPR methodology used, itinerary and details of participation is included as Annex B.

² Information in this section comes from both the EOPR process and data gathered as part of the End of Project Survey conducted in November 2008.

per cent of farming households have adopted at least two new sustainable agricultural practices

- Improving year round nutrition, from the introduction of new crops and growing techniques, and the increased availability of water for home gardens – around two thirds of women now prepare nutritionally balanced meals for their households
- Improving household hygiene and malaria prevention, thus reducing the risks to health and household productivity from common diseases – behaviour change in hand washing and use of bed nets has significantly reduced diarrhea and malaria incidence
- Providing safe and reliable water supplies to selected villages – 91 per cent of households now take less than 30 minutes per day to collect drinking water, and
- Strengthening communities to work together collectively to address problems and access services – 94 per cent of households perceive a positive impact in addressing community divisions, while immunization rates for children have increased to 98 per cent.

ER1: Strengthened management capacity and governance of local partner organisations to effectively support communities in the development, implementation and replication of project activities

The Review found positive feedback on capacity building activities from the partners/associates - CKL, KBA, KPBA and KHB, and commitment to implementing development activities in future. More than 40 partner/associate staff has been trained across a range of areas, including management and technical knowledge. Continued strengthening of organizations should be possible through the DAU project.

ER2: Democratic Village Development Organisations (VDOs) established and strengthened to effectively facilitate and manage the implementation of technical activities

VDOs and their Technical Management Committees (TMCs) have been effective through the project period. Over 3,068 villagers have received formal, informal and hands on training, while 416 committee members received training in leadership, communication and facilitation skills. Common funds improve the sustainability of infrastructure and equipment (e.g. water supplies, first aid kits) and health/agriculture activities at the village level. Village unity and collective approaches to problems were cited as some of the biggest changes resulting from the project. Monitoring of the use of common funds by project associates is recommended to continue. For future projects, minor changes to training delivery and using innovative strategies to involve the poorest households will improve implementation performance.

ER3: Portfolio of replicable and locally appropriate models for sustainable agriculture developed, implemented and promoted

Significant improvements have been obtained in yields of staple crops – e.g. corn, paddy. The introduction of livestock raising, home gardens and new cash crops has also been successful, although different villages have responded in different ways. However, 97 per cent of farming households in the target villages participated in trialing and implementing new practices. Availability of water is critical for the success of home gardens, and is the most important factor in planning other project activities. Farmers tend to be risk averse, so are more willing to experiment in common farms, where losses can be shared, or the returns delayed, as is the case

for perennial crops such as mangoes and coffee. Cross visits and demonstration plots are highly effective dissemination tools.

ER4: Replicable models for safe and reliable domestic water & sanitation systems collaboratively developed and implemented by VDO with support of partner organisations

The project has achieved almost 100 per cent household coverage with fly proof latrines. Safe and reliable water supplies are critical for the success of other project elements. Forty-six village water management plans have been completed, and 141 villagers have received technical training. The effectiveness (and probable sustainability) of water supply systems depends on the impact on household work patterns – e.g. how much time is saved, how much water is available. The project will need to monitor some village systems over the next 12 months.

ER5: Health status of targeted vulnerable communities improved

Coupled with latrine provision, health education, environmental clean up and first aid kits, there has been a consequent reduced incidence of diarrhea and related illnesses. Similarly, provision of bed nets and education in their use and maintenance has significantly reduced the incidence of malaria. Three hundred village health volunteers (VHVs) have been trained and are responsible for health education and delivery of first aid. Indicators of sustainable behaviour change include households purchasing additional nets and soap supplies. Immunization rates have been substantially improved, using an innovative model of increasing access to health department services.

ER6: Flexible networks to foster active collaboration and learning between Village Development Organisations, partner organisations and other key stakeholders established and supported

The project has helped end the isolation of many villages from each other, and from health, agriculture and other services. These elements appear to be sustainable, especially if encouraged by project associates/partners. Fifty-five cross learning visits were undertaken, and project manuals for management and technical issues have been produced and distributed. VDOs and TMCs provide points of contact for government departments. Cross learning visits have developed relationships between villages. Recommendations include the establishment of a Kayah Development Forum (with other INGOs and UNDP) to promote development education, mutual learning, advocacy and networking.

4. Effectiveness of Project Strategies

Local Empowerment: Both households and project partners/associates have improved capacity to implement changes. At the village level, organizations are now more capable of linking with other services, which will sustain a number of project benefits. Women have become more involved in village decision-making and management. Increasing the role of project associates can be further supported through the DAU project.

Agriculture, Water and Health: These areas were, and remain, the most relevant to communities in improving livelihoods and food security. The focus on training has been successful, although some improvements have been suggested previously and incorporated into the design of DAU (e.g. the use of farmer field schools). In some

locations, capacity building and community education efforts are constrained by low literacy levels.

Secure Enabling Environment: The project has improved trust at the community level, introduced systematic approaches and allowed for collective decision-making and action. Improvements in agriculture will increase resilience (i.e. food security), while health and water improvements reduce risks to households. Women, in particular, are becoming increasingly involved in village activities and income generation as a result of the project. Effective advocacy with local authorities has contributed to the success of project activities.

Model Replication: The process used by the project has been successful – adoption rates for most interventions have been very good. Importantly, communities now have the capacity and skills to trial new crops for raising income. The TMC approach is sound, offering ownership and sustainability, especially through the use of common funds. Replication by project associates by themselves has been less successful, though promising, and can be built on through the DAU project.

5. Overall Performance

Relevance

CARE's approach to implementing projects in Kayah State has been very successful – building on the work of the nutrition project, PROGRESS was able to benefit from lessons learned and adopt proven implementation approaches. This 'staged implementation' strategy also allowed CARE to learn about the security and operating environment, which has been extended through the advocacy process undertaken with government officials. PROGRESS operated very effectively in Demosoe Township, where other aid agencies have been reluctant to operate, which is a testament to both good planning and the use of locally appropriate delivery methods.

The design and implementation of the project remained relevant throughout the project period – the focus on agriculture, health and water supply reflect the most important needs of vulnerable rural communities in Kayah. Activities selected are based on decision making by group members and villagers' own priorities, providing a level of ownership by the community, which will be further developed in the DAU project.

Efficiency

The project has been managed efficiently and cost-effectively. The implementation of activities has used volunteers from the project partners/associates and the village TMCs. In addition, government staff from line agencies have been used in training and as resource people, and services such as child immunization and livestock vaccination are now being accessed successfully by villages. Some private sector/market linkages have been developed. Compared with other projects in Kayah, PROGRESS has achieved better results, a much larger impact for a lower cost, and achieved these in less time³.

³ Based on observations and discussions by the EOPR with staff of other aid projects, notably UNDP's ICDP.

Effectiveness

The effectiveness of activities in agriculture and health is measured by the adoption rates and behaviour changes observed in the villages. The vast majority of farming households now use improved varieties of staples such as corn, along with improved planting techniques and application of fertilizers/pesticides, including using low cost approaches such as compost. The project has also provided farming households with the knowledge and capacity to diversify food sources, improve nutrition and allow for year round food production through new crops, double cropping and (where sufficient water is available) home gardens. Health activities have resulted in greater hygiene and disease awareness, with the subsequent widespread use of latrines, bed nets, hand washing and other personal measures in all target villages.

Impact

Villagers have noted increases in agricultural productivity, sometimes two or three-fold when using the project-introduced techniques. This has resulted in greater food security and income for households, and improved nutrition for children. Better health will add to household productivity due to fewer days lost through illness and in reduced expenditure on medicines. The dangers of diarrhea and malaria have now been addressed, and there is an improvement in children's immunization rates, which will provide long-term health benefits for households. Where water supplies have been repaired or constructed, the time spent fetching water has been significantly reduced for women and children, and this will also increase household productivity and income. The project has fostered connections outside the village in relation to improved access to services and greater market opportunities, as well as reducing conflict within and between communities.

Sustainability

The sustainability of many activities can be inferred from the adoption rates noted above. While some crops supported by the project (e.g. garlic) have had less success in the last year due to falls in prices, communities appear to be using the skills and knowledge now available to trial other crops. Returns from perennial crops will take longer to be realized, but indications are that these collective approaches are being retained. The visible benefits from improved hygiene are such that villages are also keen on maintaining their health infrastructure (latrines, first aid kits). Prospects for the ongoing repair and maintenance of water supply systems is very good in locations where the benefits are significant, in other areas maintenance will need to be monitored. Sustainability of all activities is enhanced through the availability of common funds for agriculture, health and water supply.

List of Recommendations

1. The Review recommends that CARE build on the success of PROGRESS and continue to strengthen project partners and associates to plan and deliver development activities. Capacity building of these organizations should take place through the period of the DAU project.
2. Village planning and mobilization should include elements of natural resource planning, with a focus on water, to help in designing activities and directing project resources.
3. As part of planning and mobilization for the DAU project, it is recommended that cross visits to comparable PROGRESS villages are undertaken as early as possible, in order that members of village organizations obtain a realistic understanding of project activities.
4. New projects should examine creative means for involving the poorest households, and reducing barriers to participation in activities. These should be based on village decisions, but could take the form of labour contributions in lieu of financial contributions, or cross subsidies using village or project funds.
5. Agricultural training should be scheduled for when farming households are available, should use motivated volunteers as key farmers, and be focused on identified interests of farming households. Key farmers may be those with better access to land, from wealthier households, more time to be involved or with more education. The farmer field school approach proposed for DAU is a step in this direction.
6. Training and education materials can be further refined to take into account low levels of literacy in project villages. This means more use of pictures in manuals and instruction booklets, and delivery using demonstrations and practical hands on training.
7. Village health volunteers are proving to be a valuable resource for villages. Efforts should be made to further strengthen links with the health department and to involve volunteers in ongoing education and awareness activities.
8. CARE should examine opportunities for including adult literacy programs, especially for women, as a component of in future projects. Increased literacy will improve participation from poor households, as well as enhance income generation and capacity building activities.
9. Some water supply systems implemented by the project will need to be monitored over the next 12 months to ensure that technical and management solutions remain appropriate and that village committees have continuing capacity and commitment for repairs and maintenance.
10. The use of common funds has great potential for ensuring sustainability of many activities. Project partners and associates will need to be involved in monitoring the use of funds in their villages to ensure that money continues to be managed effectively and transparently.

11. CARE should support the formation of a 'development forum', involving local partners, associates and representatives from development agencies active in Kayah State.

MAIN REPORT

1. Purpose and Conduct of the Review

The Promoting Rural Opportunities, Generating Resources and Encouraging Social Solidarity (PROGRESS) project forms part of the European Commission (EC) Aid to Uprooted People Program for Burma/Myanmar established in 2004. The project is co-financed by the EC, the Government of Austria, CARE Österreich and CARE Norge. The project officially commenced in July 2005 (field activities started in October) and ended in December 2008. The overall objective is to improve the livelihood security of poor and marginalized internally displaced people (IDPs) in Kayah State, Myanmar.

Kayah State is one of the poorest and least accessible areas of Myanmar (see map in Annex D). Most of the population has been displaced at some time over the last two decades due to a conflict with the central government, land degradation or drought. There was a major drought between 1997-99 that severely affected rural agricultural households. It is estimated that 70-80,000 IDPs still live in host villages in Kayah State. In these locations there remains considerable vulnerability and livelihood insecurity.

The project reached over 4,365 households in 51 villages in Loikaw and Demosoe Townships. It contained activities for capacity building of local project partners/associates and village development organizations, improvements in agriculture, water supply and health, and the development of a support network. The project design did not distinguish between the types of IDPs, while working to promote cohesive communities and provide a means to help reconcile different interests and support the reintegration of affected people.

Review Objectives

The overall objective of the EOPR is to provide the European Commission (EC) with sufficient information to make an informed judgment about the performance and overall impact of the project. An additional purpose of the review is to facilitate a process that will increase the capacity of key stakeholders to engage in all steps of a learning cycle, from observation (assessment of project progress) to reflection (generation of lessons learned) and planning (development of recommendations). This will lead to greater ownership of the review outcomes and recommendations.

The purpose of the EOPR is twofold: to provide project accountability and to support continuous improvement. Specific objectives include:

- To assess the efficiency and effectiveness of the project in making timely progress towards achieving areas of impact; realizing the expected results and specific objectives (as specified in the logical framework) by project end;
- To assess the sustainability of project activities;
- To generate lessons learned from all aspects of the project, and
- To develop recommendations that may support the timely and effective implementation of the new EC-supported Demosoe Aid to the Uprooted (DAU) project in Kayah⁴.

Conduct of the Review

A participatory approach and methodology for the EOPR was prepared with CARE management and project staff in Yangon and Loikaw prior to field visits. Background material, project reports and other relevant documents were analysed. These

⁴ The full Terms of Reference for the EOPR are contained in Annex A.

included the End of Project Survey Report produced in November 2008, which provided a range of statistical data on project results, and comparisons with the original baseline study from 2005. Survey and assessment tools for the EOPR were also developed, based on the successful operation of the MTR in June-July 2007, designed to add qualitative information to that collected during the survey. The review team⁵ then visited a sample of project sites in Loikaw and Demosoë Townships from 28 November to 4 December 2008. Presentations on preliminary findings were held with project field staff and project partners/associates in Loikaw on 4 December and with CARE country office staff in Yangon on 7 December.

Village site visits included consultations with a range of community members, from representatives of technical management committees, village volunteers, village development organisations, and women's groups. Stakeholder consultations were held with project partners/associates, representatives of government agencies, and staff of other aid agencies operating in Kayah⁶.

The consultant greatly appreciates the courtesy and kindness extended by CARE Myanmar staff, village communities and others that gave generously of their time and facilitated arrangements for the visit. This report was prepared by the consultant and therefore does not necessarily represent the views of CARE Myanmar or the European Commission.

⁵ The MTR was conducted by CARE Myanmar staff with assistance from a consultant, Mr. Bill Pennington. The approach, methodology and itinerary are detailed in Annex B, along with the toolkit used for field visits and the consultant's work plan.

⁶ Annex E contains reports from site visits and meetings/consultations undertaken by the MTR. A full list of persons met and organizations consulted is included.

2. Situation Analysis

2.1 Project Context

Kayah State is located in the east of Myanmar and shares an international border with Thailand. The population is made up of various ethnic groups - including Kayah, Kayen (Kayan), Kayaw, Pa O and Padaung groups. There are three main religious affiliations – Buddhist (44 per cent), Catholic (37%) and Baptist (19%). About 1 in 10 of the nominally Buddhist population adhere to traditional animist beliefs. Village communities can be relatively homogeneous in terms of ethnicity and/or religion, however there is still significant mistrust, tension and conflict within and between villages.

The total population of Kayah State is approximately 300,000. Access and movement within the state is restricted. Conflict between rebel groups and the government has existed since Myanmar gained independence from Britain in 1948. The rebel groups are highly factionalized. The conflict reached a peak of intensity between 1991 and 1996. Following this period, ceasefire agreements were achieved with three rebel groups from 1994, however the largest group continues to reject a negotiated settlement. As a result, the situation in many areas of the state remains insecure and unstable. So-called 'cease-fire groups' are relatively important actors in parts of Kayah State, and have some influence in aspects of governance and village development.

Over the last few decades, displacement of people has occurred, particularly during the period 1995-96. Observers categorize IDPs in four ways: (a) those returned to their original villages, (b), those relocated to new villages, (c) those living with relatives, and (d) those remaining in relocation camps. The economic circumstances and living conditions of IDPs and other villagers residing in the same locations are often indistinguishable. While the project targets villages with a high proportion of displaced people, it does not make a distinction when implementing activities, and offers participation and benefits to all village members including creating an environment for the reduction of conflict.

2.2 Project Location

The original project design covered poor and marginalized people from 5,000 households living in 51 villages in three townships - Loikaw, Demosoe and Phrusoe, with the possibility of extension into Shardaw in Year 2 or 3. As a result of access restrictions and security issues in Phrusoe and Shardaw, the project was then redesigned to operate in 51 villages only in Loikaw and Demosoe, with the total household coverage slightly reduced.

Areas with greater stability, such as Loikaw and Demosoe Townships, are located on the western side of the Thanlwin River. Reports suggest that groups of people with greatest need in Kayah are located in the remaining villages on the eastern side, which are difficult to access, located far apart and retain only small populations. In general, international NGOs and other agencies are not given permission to operate in these areas. Voluntary migration from remote areas and the eastern side to Loikaw and Demosoe occurred from 1991 to 1996 in response to both armed conflict and severe land degradation. Even so, the target villages in Loikaw and Demosoe are still characterized by physical remoteness, complex and fractious ethnic composition, low levels of utilization of agricultural-production technology and inadequate institutional arrangements for delivery of goods and services.

The project's target communities are living in areas characterised by frequent armed conflict and a highly sensitive political situation. They are politically, socially and economically insecure.

2.3 Problem Analysis and Response

The immediate problems faced by villages in the project areas are concerned with agriculture/livestock, health and water supply. Within and outside the village, there are problems caused by community divisions, the potential for armed conflict and proximity to the international border. Whereas some of the underlying causes of insecure household livelihoods can be addressed directly (e.g. improved food security, access to water and health services), the promotion of a secure enabling environment will require a different form of response – through promoting community collaboration and local partnerships, and implementing conflict mitigation and reduction measures.

In Loikaw and Demosoe, shifting cultivation is still practiced, and coupled with population growth results in over-utilization of natural resources, which threatens food security and the continuing livelihood of farming households. Related problems such as poor soil management practices, insufficient water, poor seed varieties and livestock breeds, lack and/or limited extension services, limited access to land and markets and poor material inputs have also impacted upon productivity. A severe drought affected the area in the late 1990s, while more recently food shortages were reported from August 2005 through to April 2006, with the worst shortages reported during the rainy season.

Health problems, such as malaria and diarrhea, are common in these areas due to isolation, lack of prevention measures, poor sanitation and limited access to health services. The lack of reliable and safe water supplies adds to the problems and the spread of communicable disease. Even when water supplies are adequate, the quality is often poor, particularly in the rainy season.

As a result of displacement, the social fabric of communities has been disrupted. Communities need to rebuild village structures and create 'normal' relationships at the township and state level. There is a need for developing advocacy and other relationships with service providers, local NGOs or linkages with the private sector. The situation in cross border areas is volatile and includes a range of social, political and economic factors, such as trade, trafficking, displacement and the presence of minefields.

CARE conducted two participatory needs assessments in January 2003 and August 2004 in Kayah. The existing emergency nutrition project⁷ provided a set of lessons learned for operating in the area, and an understanding of the village level context. The design process identified influencing factors and underlying causes of insecure livelihoods. The project design contains a set of specific Expected Results (ERs) linked to the three 'technical' components of agriculture/livestock, health and water supply. Surrounding these are components that deal with building capacity of project associates, village organizations and developing a support network. The premise of the design is that implementing the technical elements provides the opportunities for capacity building and network development. The original design⁸ included a phased approach, however with the decision to work only in Loikaw and Demosoe, and given

⁷ 'Emergency Food Support for Internally Displaced and Vulnerable Populations in Kayah State'

⁸ Aid to Uprooted People Program - Burma/Myanmar, Grant Application Form, Budget Line 19 10 03 Publication Reference: EuropeAid/119964/C/G/MM

the limited time frame of three years, most activities commenced immediately in 44 villages. Another 7 villages were added in Year 2.

The Mid Term Review in 2007 made a number of recommendations for PROGRESS. These are summarized in the following table, along with the project's response. The MTR also made recommendations on changing elements of the design and for improving performance indicators to make them more relevant and useful for measurement of project achievements. However, while agreeing to most of the MTR recommendations (see table), CARE decided to leave the original design's performance indicators as they were, with the exception of additional elements related to the production of project manuals and training materials. These are highlighted against the relevant Expected Result.

MTR Recommendation	Project Response
<i>Project Duration</i>	
The MTR recommends that a non-cost extension of 6 months be approved	Approved by EC, project end date now December 2008
<i>Project Handover</i>	
The project's response in Year 3 should examine opportunities for further developing organizational, management and operational capacities of project associates, and develop a Handover Strategy	Handover Strategy developed and operational for 2008 with plans developed by project partners and associates for 2009
It is recommended that the Handover Strategy include the development of a project management manual, bringing together PROGRESS training programs, technical materials and other relevant information	Rather than one project manual, a range of manuals have been produced based on project activities, training courses or specific technical issues
The MTR recommends that the technical materials, knowledge and experience of the project at the village level should be brought together in a Village Development Manual	See above – villages now have a range of different manuals and information sheets
<i>Training</i>	
Improved evaluation of training will provide the project with information for developing the manuals and further improving training	See above
The project will need to strengthen the cascade model of training in the remaining period	Training of project associates and partners, and members of VDOs continued through Year 3. Capability of partners/associates to replicate training will also be strengthened through implementation of DAU
<i>Gender</i>	
Participation by women at the village level has been significant, and this should be further encouraged by the project	Increase in female representation on VDOs and TMCs through 2007-08, due to specific strategies for encouraging women to participate, especially in water user groups
<i>Technical Issues</i>	
It is recommended that the project identifies the most successful interventions in agriculture (and the reasons why they are successful) and then integrate these results into project manuals	Manuals and information sheets produced and distributed to project partners, associates and villages
In Year 3, the project should include models of effective dissemination and adoption in the development of project manuals	See above
The project should examine how the construction-oriented water TMCs might evolve into more representative water user groups	Village water committees now include more representatives of household users, including women
Water and sanitation construction and management lessons learned, together with successful models, should be collected, analyzed and included in project manuals	See above
It is recommended that the most successful interventions in health education and prevention be	See above

assessed and then integrated into project manuals	
<i>Networks</i>	
In Year 3, the project should expand and strengthen the social networks established. This can be done through the process of existing project activities and innovations aimed at bringing a broader range of groups together, especially through field days, cross-learning and dissemination programs	Additional cross visits undertaken, and included in design of DAU project
<i>Future Activities</i>	
Future projects implemented in Kayah may benefit from examining and considering alternative models of group formation	DAU design takes into account lessons from PROGRESS and other CARE projects such as IFLS in Chin State
The MTR recommends that any future long-term assistance build on the success of both PROGRESS and the emergency nutrition projects	DAU will be operating in Demosoe, and the operational principles are similar to both the nutrition project and PROGRESS
<i>Other</i>	
The MTR recommends that CARE, perhaps in conjunction with other agencies, develop a glossary of development terms in the Myanmar language for use in project training	Remains a priority

2.4 Validity of Assumptions

- (a) Sufficient social and political environment for implementation of project activities

The project has not suffered any undue delays or constraints due to the social and political environment in Kayah. Positive advocacy methods with the government have ensured the project operated successfully.

- (b) Sufficient access to target beneficiaries

Access to the project villages remains adequate, and the delivery approach was flexible enough to take into account the necessary government approvals. Other agencies continue to find difficulties operating outside Loikaw, which makes the inclusion of Demosoe in PROGRESS (and in DAU) an important achievement.

- (c) No major escalation of conflict

While the conflict continues at a low level, there have been some sporadic incidents near to project villages. These have not had a severe impact on project delivery, although it has affected travel of field staff from time to time. There have been no major threats to project staff or materials arising from the conflict.

- (d) No major health epidemic outbreaks

No major disease outbreaks have occurred.

- (e) No major climatic impacts (droughts) arising during the implementation period

Natural resource degradation affects the results of agricultural inputs and some water supply activities. However the project does take these factors into account during design and implementation. The fall in market prices of some crops (especially corn and garlic) has affected household income for some farmers.

- (f) Project partners/associates and communities are willing to collaborate with the project, and commit resources (human and financial) to managing and implementing activities

Participation by staff of project partners/associates is considerable and they take an active role in fieldwork. Village communities are enthusiastic; however they (like the partners/associates) have limited capacities and resources.

- (g) Beneficiaries will remain in their current location and there is no major new displacement among targeted villages

No major displacement has occurred during the project period due to conflict. Low-level migration of people continues as households resettle, and the project has adjusted targets accordingly.

- (h) The enabling environment for social networks is maintained with a low likelihood of serious misunderstandings or conflicts between partners

The project has been a catalyst for improving relations and understanding between the project partners/associates, and for encouraging their greater involvement in village development. Good advocacy with government agencies and the involvement of line agencies in activities has prevented misunderstandings and allowed continued operational access.

3. Project Achievements

3.1 Overall Progress

The Review found that the project has made an important contribution to improving household resilience and the livelihoods of displaced people in Kayah. All components of the project have been implemented successfully and have produced results. Project partners/associates have improved their capacity and skills, and village organizations are working effectively and sustainably.

Relevance

The design of PROGRESS was based on an assessment of lessons from the nutrition project in Kayah and an estimate of where it was possible to implement a longer-term, development oriented project. Activities such as agriculture, health and water supply require effective engagement with the community and with partners/associates, and continuous access over periods such as growing seasons and during construction of infrastructure such as water tanks or reticulation systems. While there were no guarantees, these criteria could really only be met for villages in Loikaw and Demosoe. At the same time, the shorter-term nutrition project moved into Phrusoe and Shardaw Townships, offering CARE an opportunity to assess the situation in those locations.

The Review found that PROGRESS has operated very effectively in Demosoe Township, where other aid agencies have been reluctant to operate, which is a testament to both good planning and the use of locally appropriate delivery methods. The experience of the nutrition project and Medecins Sans Frontieres (MSF) in other townships, where access is difficult and permission to travel harder to obtain, indicates that CARE's approach has been vindicated.

The design and implementation of the project itself remained relevant throughout the project period – the focus on agriculture; health and water supply reflect the most important needs of vulnerable rural communities in Kayah. Activities selected are based on decision making by group members and villagers' own priorities, providing a level of ownership by the community.

Efficiency

The project has been managed efficiently and cost-effectively. The implementation of activities has used volunteers from the project partners/associates and the village TMCs. In addition, government staff from line agencies have been used in training and as resource people, and services such as child immunization and livestock vaccination are now being accessed successfully by villages. Some private sector/market linkages have been developed. UNDP's project in Loikaw Township – the Integrated Community Development Project (ICDP), commenced around the same time as PROGRESS, is on a similar scale (58 villages) and has a similar range of activities. ICDP, however, has different implementation approaches, which are managed directly by UNDP, and has access to more resources. The Review was not able to assess the results of ICDP, however discussion with project staff and other agencies suggests that PROGRESS has achieved a greater impact at the village level over the three and a half year period, and has done so more cost effectively.

Effectiveness

The effectiveness of activities in agriculture and health is measured by the adoption rates and behaviour changes observed in the villages. The vast majority of farming

households now use improved varieties of staples such as corn, along with improved planting techniques and application of fertilizers/pesticides, including using low cost approaches such as compost. The project has also provided farming households with the knowledge and capacity to diversify food sources, improve nutrition and allow for year round food production through new crops, double cropping and (where sufficient water is available) home gardens. Health activities have resulted in greater hygiene and disease awareness, with the subsequent widespread use of latrines, bed nets, hand washing and other personal measures in all target villages. There is no doubt that the project has assisted households across all 51 villages to become more resilient, while food security has increased and the risks associated with health and poor water supplies have been considerably reduced.

Impact

Villagers have noted increases in agricultural productivity, sometimes two or three-fold when using the project-introduced techniques. This has resulted in greater food security and income for households, and improved nutrition for children. The project has also assisted in reducing household debt. Better health will add to household productivity due to fewer days lost through illness and in reduced expenditure on medicines. The dangers of diarrhea and malaria have now been addressed, and there is an improvement in children's immunization rates, which will provide long-term health benefits for households. Where water supplies have been repaired or constructed, the time spent fetching water has been significantly reduced for women and children, and this will also increase household productivity and income. The project has fostered connections outside the village in relation to improved access to services and greater market opportunities, as well as reducing conflict within and between communities.

Sustainability

The sustainability of many activities can be inferred from the adoption rates noted above. While some crops supported by the project (e.g. garlic) have had less success in the last year due to falls in prices, communities appear to be using the skills and knowledge now available to trial other crops, such as green gram. The Review believes that the project, through training and awareness has both improved the skills of farmers in cultivation and assisted households in target villages to become more responsive to market conditions. Returns from perennial crops will take longer to be realized, but indications are that these collective approaches are being retained. The visible benefits from improved hygiene are such that villages are also keen on maintaining their health infrastructure (latrines, first aid kits). Water supply systems also provide considerable benefits in most villages and the prospects for their ongoing repair and maintenance are very good. Sustainability of all activities is enhanced through the availability of common funds for agriculture, health and water supply.

3.2 Effectiveness of Project Strategies

Local Empowerment: Both households and project partners/associates have improved capacity to implement changes. At the village level, organizations are now more capable of linking with other services, which will sustain a number of project benefits. Women have become more involved in village decision-making and management. Building capacity of project associates can be further supported through their role in the DAU project.

Agriculture, Water and Health: These areas were, and remain, the most relevant to communities in improving livelihoods and food security. The focus on training has

been successful, although some improvements have been suggested previously and incorporated into the design of DAU (e.g. the use of farmer field schools). In some locations, capacity building and community education efforts are constrained by low literacy levels.

Secure Enabling Environment: The project has improved trust at the community level, introduced systematic approaches and allowed for collective decision-making and action. Improvements in agriculture will increase resilience (i.e. food security), while health and water improvements reduce risks to households. Women, in particular, are becoming increasingly involved in village activities and income generation as a result of the project. Effective advocacy with local authorities has contributed to the success of project activities.

Model Replication: The process used by the project has been successful – adoption rates for most interventions have been very good. Importantly, communities now have the capacity and skills to trial new crops for raising income. The TMC approach is sound, offering ownership and sustainability, especially through the use of common funds. Replication by project associates by themselves has been less successful, though promising, and can be built on through the DAU project.

3.3 Objectives

The analysis used by the Review assesses progress against the overall objective, specific objectives and Expected Results using the indicators in the project’s existing logical framework (logframe). Data comes from the village site visits undertaken as part of this Review⁹, and the End of Project Survey, which was conducted independently. Where statistical data is not available, the Review has provided an estimate based on the best available information.

Annex C contains a summary of the findings of the MTR and the reported results of the End of Project Survey against each level of the intervention logic.

Overall Objective

The overall objective of PROGRESS is to improve the livelihood security of poor and marginalised Internally Displaced People (IDP) households from different ethnic and religious groups in Kayah State, Myanmar. The project targets villages with a high proportion of displaced people, although it does not make a distinction between households when implementing activities, and offers participation and benefits to all village members. The selected villages include those with all major ethnic and religious groups in the state, and components of the project support efforts in peace building and conflict resolution.

Indicator	Rating	Comments/Assessment
75% of farming IDP households increased food production by up to 20%	Exceeded	Staple crop yields (i.e. corn) have increased by between 80-100 per cent for participating households. Double cropping and introduction of new crops and techniques have increased both the amount and range of food available. Villagers report increases in household income.
60% of targeted IDP households increased access to a greater diversity	Exceeded	Ninety-six per cent of households grow up to 40 types of crops for both home consumption and for sale. Home gardens (where water is available) allow for year round

⁹ Village site visits and consultation meeting reports are contained in Annex E.

of nutritious food		food production.
At least 80% of households (esp. with children) targeted with water & sanitation activities have reduced episodes of diarrhoea by 50%	Achieved	Diarrhea incidence has been reduced significantly due to behaviour changes (hand washing, use of soap, use of latrines, personal hygiene). Villagers report that with education and availability of ORS, acute cases of diarrhea no longer present a danger to life.
35% of children under 5 from IDP households increase food intake (balance in 3 food groups) by up to 20%	Exceeded	Households with increased food intake include 85 per cent of children under 5 in the target villages.
30% reduction in working days lost due to illness in targeted IDP households	Probably achieved	Villagers report improved health and fewer working days lost due to reduced incidence of common diseases (especially malaria due to use of bed nets introduced by the project). Increased access to safe and reliable water supplies has had a major effect on household productivity, especially for women.
50% of VDO representatives have access to organisations and networks beyond village level	Exceeded	All villages reported improved access to services (especially children's immunization and livestock vaccination); all have continuing relationships with the partner/associate and private sector suppliers of seed, fertilizers and pesticides.
At least 40% of farming HH with surplus have access to marketing information for agricultural produce and livestock	Probably achieved	Around one third of household food production and one eighth of livestock production from all households is sold outside villages, and therefore responsive to market conditions. Villages located close to markets, and those with cash crop production, are responding to price changes.

Specific Objective

At least 4,285 households are empowered to collaboratively model, implement and replicate agriculture, water and health interventions that also encourage a secure enabling environment.

Redesign of the project and more accurate data gathered during the project's mobilization period meant that there were 4,365 participating households by the end of the project. This represents around 22,700 beneficiaries in the 51 target villages¹⁰.

Indicator	Rating	Comments/Assessment
75% of farming IDP households adopt at least two new sustainable agricultural practices on their farms	Exceeded	86 per cent of households report using at least two practices introduced by the project. These will be continued beyond the end of the project.
50% of women from IDP households targeted with home gardening and/or livestock breeding have increased diversity and quantity of food	Exceeded	74 per cent of women using home gardens and 85 per cent of women using livestock techniques report increased diversity and quantity of food. Household income has increased, enabling purchase of food from other households or markets if required.
35% women prepare daily food with proper nutrition balance among three food groups	Exceeded	Two thirds of women report preparing daily food with nutritional balance between the three food groups.
50% of farming IDP HH with surplus have increased	Probably achieved	Around one third of household food production and one eighth of livestock production from all households is sold

¹⁰ Refer to the 'Aid to Uprooted People Programme, Burma/Myanmar, Grant Application Form, Budget line 19 10 03: EuropeAid/1 19964/C/G/MM' – i.e. the Design Document and subsequent communications between CARE and EU

awareness of marketing agricultural produce and livestock		outside villages, and therefore responsive to market conditions. Villages located close to markets, and those with cash crop production, are responding to price changes.
At least 50% of target households with improved access to sufficient and reliable water for drinking and household use	Exceeded	90 per cent of households spend less than 30 minutes per day in water collection. Household productivity has increased, while the safety and reliability of water collection has had a big impact on women and children.
At least 70% of IDP households seek improved health services for illnesses	Achieved	Village health volunteers cover 100 per cent of households with basic first aid treatments, and can stabilize patients before transferring to health centers or hospitals. Volunteers have developed linkages with the health department in the case of TB and malaria referrals.
60% of members of community development organisations (VDOs) perceive to influence committee decisions	Exceeded	98 per cent of VDO members perceive they an influence decisions. Women now consider that, due to the project, they have a voice in decision making.
At least 40% HH participating in community development activities perceive positive impact on community divisions	Exceeded	94 per cent of participating households consider that the project has improved community cohesion. Villagers note that collective approaches to activities and to problem solving has brought their communities together.
50% of HH are aware of and have access to information about border effects	Probably achieved	Training in border effects issues has been provided to all participating villages.
At least 9 models descriptions for community development linked to a secure enabling environment available to local stakeholders	Achieved	A range of manuals and guides for project activities and subsequent replication of training have been produced for partners/associates and village organizations.
At least new 2 models replicated in new areas by 2 different partner organisations	Partly achieved	Project partner/associate staff have started to replicate agriculture and health practices in their own communities.

3.4 Expected Results

ER 1: Partner Strengthening

Strengthened management capacity and governance of local partner organisations to effectively support communities in the development, implementation and replication of project activities

PROGRESS uses three project associates in Kayah: Catholic Karuna Loikaw (CKL), Kayah Baptist Association (KBA), Kayaphu Baptist Association (KPBA) and Kay Htoe Boh (KHB). CKL have a well-developed management structure and implement a range of projects (including micro finance) on behalf of the church and donors. KBA and KPBA implement a smaller number of projects than CKL and also run scholarships and micro finance programs. KHB are a Buddhist/Animist religious and welfare organization that has only recently entered into development activities. Across Kayah and Shan States, they operate in upwards of 140 villages. CKL, KBA and KPBA have written agreements with CARE, while KHB does not. None of the organizations is officially registered with the government.

Each partner/associate is responsible for a group of villages within the project. Volunteers from the partners/associates work alongside the project's field staff (i.e. community facilitators). Regular monthly planning and coordination meetings

between partners/associates and the project are held. Coordination meetings are regarded as a good opportunity to see how the other organizations are working, share experiences and discuss common problems. CKL noted that regular meetings have improved understanding and trust. Joint monitoring visits of project villages are a good example of this cooperation. KHB stated that they are able to ask for assistance from the other project associates, and appreciate the chance to plan together. KPBA said that previously, the organizations had gone in their own directions, but now they had found some common ground. At the moment, the focal point for the coordination meetings is PROGRESS, rather than a more general development forum in Kayah State. Coordination meetings will continue as part of the DAU project.

The project design envisaged that project partners/associates would progressively take over project activities. The project developed a Handover Strategy, which has been progressively implemented during 2008. This has required partners/associates to work with their villages on producing plans for continuing activities in 2009. These activities follow on from the project, and will be funded from within partner/associate and village resources. The Review noted that in the villages visited, these plans had been prepared in conjunction with VDOs, and were quite detailed. All partners/associates were keen to implement the agreed handover strategy, and to remain active in their respective villages over the next 12 months.

The project undertook an analysis of the project partner organizations at the beginning of Year 3, and the Review was informed that a follow up analysis is planned before project completion. CKL felt confident that they could implement their own activities, and source support from government agencies if required. KHB said that they had two very capable staff that could continue the work, while they had over 100 villages in their organization; however they remain confident that they can replicate the village mobilization model. KBA noted they would focus more on interest groups at the community level, and were capable of re-disseminating technical knowledge and training learned under PROGRESS. KPBA said they had existing relationships with the various technical committees, and with their trained volunteers, are prepared to replicate the project activities in new villages.

The partners/associates felt that the DAU project would also provide opportunities for them to further strengthen their organizations. Training and capacity building priorities mentioned included:

- Management/group formation/team building (CKL);
- Participatory action and research (KHB);
- More orientation for development (KPBA and KBA), and
- Disaster management (KPBA)

Recommendations for improving projects in the future included more emphasis on increasing village self-reliance (CKL), addressing the needs of the urban poor (KBA), extending to cover all villages in Kayah (KHB) and increasing opportunities for cooperation (KPBA). According to the project associates, the biggest challenges to implementing development programs in Kayah remain sensitivities of government officials to church based organizations working in the field, distrust between people of different religious affiliations, (rather than ethnic or linguistic differences) and low levels of education and awareness in communities, resulting in difficulties when introducing change.

Indicator	Rating	Comments/Assessment
20 local partner staff trained in group formation, management and technical knowledge, conflict resolution and networking skills by end of Y2	Exceeded	40 partner and associate staff trained by end of Y3. Regular coordination meetings and joint monitoring visits. Project manuals and guides distributed to organizations.
20 local partner staff received training in understanding of rights and responsibilities of a civil society organisation by end of Y2	Exceeded	30 staff trained by the end of Y3.
51 needs assessment at village level facilitated by partner organisation by end of Y2	Achieved	Needs assessments completed by end of Y3. Partners and associates have developed village plans for 2009.
5 conflict resolution trainings facilitated by the partners staff by EOP	Exceeded	Eight training sessions in Y2 and Y3 with 117 participants from 37 villages.
100 of community development activities facilitated by partner organisations by EOP	Will be achieved	Handover strategy implemented during 2008. Minimum of 41 activities have been implemented directly by partners and associates, with all to be delivered this way in 2009. Partners and associates now lead VDO meetings, annual reviews, work associated with managing common funds and meetings with government line departments.
Project management manual and a reference and training manual handed over to 4 project associates	Achieved	Partners and associates have access to, and copies of, all project manuals and training materials produced.

ER 2: Village Development Organisations

Democratic Village Development Organisations (VDOs) established and strengthened to effectively facilitate and manage the implementation of technical activities

Villages report that the project has fostered greater understanding between different elements of the community, especially in overcoming religious and/or ethnic divisions¹¹. Prior to the project, there had not been any effective village level organizations, and women had been excluded from the VPDC. The establishment of VDOs has provided a forum for discussion and consultation of village matters, not just those related to the project and its activities. Where collective activities have taken place (e.g. planning, perennial crops, nurseries, construction and management of shared water supplies), this has extended to better relations with other parts of the village, and with other nearby villages. Women noted that participation in the project has allowed them access to information and training, have been more involved in decision-making and are more confident at 'speaking up' in village meetings.

Following the MTR recommendations, the project has been more active in encouraging female participation. This reflected the need to represent household users in the management of water supply systems, rather than just those members who had been involved in construction. Women have increased their membership on all village committees from 33 per cent in Year 2 to 44 per cent at the end of the project (see table).

¹¹ For a good example, refer to the Village Site Visit Report for Dau Ta Shar East and West in Annex E.

Village Committee Membership	Year 2		Year 3	
	M	F	M	F
VDOs	183	81	196	105
TMCs (Agriculture)	221	107	201	117
TMCs (Water)	191	34	200	188
VHTs	123	135	103	151
Total	718	357	700	561

A number of villages reported that low levels of education and literacy have limited the number of people who can hold positions within village committees. This is a particular problem in more remote villages, where the conflict has interrupted schooling for a generation of community members. While the project has taken a number of steps for including all households, villagers also noted that some of the poorest households were not able to participate due to lack of time, or an inability to raise contributions. In at least two villages visited by the Review, village committees either waived contributions from poor households (see box) or allowed members to contribute labour in lieu of cash. These are innovative solutions in reducing barriers to participation, and could be used in other locations - and perhaps encouraged in the DAU project.

Reducing Debt and a Helping Hand

In Dau Ta Shar West village, the agriculture common fund is used to assist farmers at the beginning of the growing season. This year, each household received 10,000 kyats, with the farmer obliged to repay 1,000 kyats after the harvest. Thus, the fund grows from year to year, and reduces reliance on commercial moneylenders.

The village also uses the VDO common fund to subsidize school fees for the poorest households in the village (i.e. those headed by women). Monthly water contributions are also waived for these households.

The project has continued to exceed the original training targets, demonstrating the efficacy of the 'cascade' or 'train the trainer' approach. Technical training is appreciated by participants, and is highly valued by them as individuals. Management training (especially for VDOs) has been very effective at helping build unity and understanding of how the activities are being organized. In particular, a number of village meetings reported that bookkeeping training has meant greater transparency in the way common funds are managed and allocated.

Villagers have identified a number of areas where general training and technical training in agriculture, water and health could be improved. These include:

- Training delivered in the village, allowing more people to take part, and reducing the time taken for participants to travel
- Scheduling training for the times when people are more likely to be available – e.g. December to February
- More use of practical demonstrations and cross-visits

The project adopted a number of these improvements following similar findings of the MTR. A further improvement emerging from the project is the use of the 'farmer field school' model for agricultural training, which will be adopted in the new DAU project, and will address some farmers' concerns. This model is designed to make more effective use of key farmers, allow for practical training in village locations, as well as

organizing training around specific crop types or technologies. A variation of this model has been used successfully in other CARE projects in Myanmar.

Other changes in response to community needs included more use of pictures in education sessions, to allow for low levels of literacy. Training manuals and other materials have now been produced and distributed to villages.

Indicator	Rating	Comments/Assessment
153 community members trained to take active roles and responsibilities in modelling community development interventions by Y2	Exceeded	960 villagers have received formal, informal and hands on training to take active roles in community development activities. VDOs and TMCs/VHTs are proving effective and sustainable mechanisms for planning and implementing activities, as well as providing a forum for participation and decision-making.
153 committee members received training in leadership, communication and facilitation skills by Y2	Exceeded	416 committee members have received training – with 50 per cent female participation.
10 different village interventions (e.g. agricultural trials, health campaigns) identified and successfully implemented by EOP	Exceeded	More than 43 different village interventions have been successfully implemented.
100 households, VDOs and partner staffs trained to apply simple monitoring tools such as SWOT analysis by EOP	Achieved	Problem/SWOT analysis include in all village planning processes, forming part of the 51 need assessments carried out involving VDOs, and the capacity building of partners/associates (40 staff).
255 community members trained in technical knowledge and skills (agriculture, water and health) by EOP	Exceeded	Over the course of the project, 3,068 community members have been trained in technical knowledge and skills for agriculture, water and health.
Project management manual and a reference and training manual handed over to 4 project associates	Achieved	Project partners and associates, VDOs and TMCs all have access to, and copies of, project manuals and training materials produced.

The Review found a number of changes to the operations of village committees since the MTR. Committees were now more mature in their approaches to problems, had more female participation, and were being increasingly used by villages as dispute resolution and problem solving forums. Perhaps even more significantly, the committees now have access to reasonably sized common funds, which have grown over the project period. These funds provide not only capital for activities, but their management is a reason for the continued existence of VDOs as well as the technical committees. They will be a major factor in the sustainability of activities following the end of the project. The Review notes, however, that with 43 VDOs and numerous other committees, it is inevitable that problems will occur with common funds. Project partners and associates have also been trained in management and bookkeeping, and will need to take an ongoing role in monitoring village finances to ensure accountability and transparency.

The project's role in Kayah as a catalyst for introducing sustainable change should not be underestimated. Improving access to government services has involved community education, but has been enhanced through the creation of village committees, that provide a contact point for line agencies. For example, the VHTs work closely with health department midwives, while the agriculture TMCs liaise with the livestock department to access animal vaccines.

ER 3: Sustainable Agriculture

Portfolio of replicable and locally appropriate models for sustainable agriculture developed, implemented and promoted

Agricultural demonstrations and trials included the introduction of new crop varieties, improved planting and spacing techniques, improved soil conservation, compost making and correct use of pesticides and fertilizers. Major successes have been achieved in corn (maize), groundnuts, green gram, potatoes and other home garden vegetables. Training in new techniques (seed selection, double cropping, proper spacing and sowing) has resulted in improved productivity and year round household food production, with a greater variety of vegetables available for home consumption and the market. The use of model farms, trials and demonstrations is one of the most important reasons for the high adoption rates in target villages, where it is estimated that nearly 2,000 farmers are now replicating agricultural practices introduced by the project.

Increasing Incomes

The Okay village cluster consists of four villages with different ethnic backgrounds and religious affiliations. The project supplied water system has enabled households to have year round access to water for drinking and home gardens.

Pig rearing has spread through proven success – in Dau Ta Say hamlet, an initial set of 27 pigs provided by the project has expanded to stall raising by all 48 households, despite a traditional belief that breeding animals brings bad luck. One woman from the village sold a litter of 10 piglets for 30,000 kyats each.

Home gardens have allowed some women to gain extra income of up to 60,000 kyats from crops such as betel leaf, long beans and flowers (i.e. chrysanthemums – in demand for temple offerings). One village member estimated that each household would have an immediate increase in income of 100-300,000 kyats per annum from participation in the project.

Some of the impacts from increased income from agriculture have included reduced debt, with profits now used to fund capital costs for the next growing season, household improvements (brick houses, new zinc roofs) and contributions to the common fund to support further income generation activities (seed bank, new cash crops).

The introduction of hybrid corn variety CP 888 has been successful, and has given the project a great deal of credibility with villagers. Yields are reportedly 2 to 3 times higher for the new variety, and when combined with improved cultivation, result in increases in food security for the majority of participating households. The Review found that almost all households in the participating villages have switched from the traditional varieties to the new type over the last three years. This shows how effective good demonstration plots can be, especially when involving farmers' staple crops. The project has put farmers in contact with private sector seed and pesticide/fertilizer suppliers, and the network of growers is expanding such that this will be sustainable beyond the end of the project.

The MTR observed that cash crops such as garlic had potential to increase income for farmers with home gardens. The Review found that due to a fall in the market price, these gains have not been realized, however farmers were using the techniques and opportunities provided by the project to try other cash crops, such as groundnuts, onions, green gram, sunflowers and canola. It is apparent that increasing the capacities and skills of farmers is perhaps more important than identifying and trialing particular crops. Once connected to the market, and involved in cultivation of cash crops, farming households will respond to market demand.

In relation to staple crops, however, farmers tend to be risk averse, given their value to household food security; however the adoption of CP 888 corn shows that this can be overcome. The introduction of perennial crops also shows how farmers can be encouraged to experiment. Evidence from the project suggests that the collective approach to model farms allows farmers to share risks, and to try crops and cultivation methods where returns are on a longer time scale. The project has assisted in the planting of 25 acres of coffee, 12 acres of mangoes, and 4 acres of oranges that are owned and farmed collectively.

With livestock activities, the project adopted a collective approach in some villages, where groups of women expressed an interest in pig raising. Participants construct a stall, while the project provides two pigs, training in stall raising, and food for 3 months and vaccines for an initial period, after which villagers can obtain access to vaccination services provided by a government department. Pig raising has already increased household incomes in a number of villages one women's group noted that stall raising and improved animal health meant pigs could be sold after 12 months, rather than two years, a doubling in productivity. Education and awareness of the benefits of livestock vaccination through the project, along with visibly healthier animals, has increased demand for vaccines, which is also expected to continue following the end of the project.

Indicator	Rating	Comments/Assessment
10 of good indigenous practices identified in the farming system analysis by end of Y2	Exceeded	14 practices identified.
5 of potential agriculture produce and livestock species identified through agricultural market research by EOP	Achieved	6 cash crops species and pig raising identified. Significant yield increases in staple crops (corn, paddy), improving food security and increasing potential for income generation. Reduced impact of animal diseases due to vaccination program.
255 of IDP farmers graduated in development, implement and replicating the agricultural models by EOP	Exceeded	1,957 farmers engaged in replicating practices. Manuals and information sheets made available to village committees and key farmers. Rates of adoption are very high, particularly for staple crops and those with a high market value.
75% of farming IDP households engaged in trialling and implementing sustainable agriculture practices by EOP	Achieved	Most farmers in target villages have participated in trials or implementation, particularly when staple crops are targeted for improvement. Demonstration plots, model farms and cross visits are very effective tools for dissemination.
10 of different replicable practices (e.g. different crop varieties, soil management) for sustainable agricultural developed by EOP	Achieved	9 replicable practices identified.
10 of operational manuals for the respective agricultural models documented by EOP	Achieved	Operational manuals documented, produced and distributed covering all agricultural training and technical activities undertaken by the project. TMCs have the capacity to undertake follow on training, with support from

A set of reference and training modules on agriculture developed to be included in the project training manual	Achieved	partners and associates. VDOs and agriculture TMCs all have access to, and copies of, project manuals and training materials produced.
--	----------	---

The Review observed that the livestock department was very supportive of the project's activities in educating villagers on the benefits of regular vaccinations. This has enabled their own field staff to engage more effectively with farmers and village committees in providing a regular service beyond the end of the project. Agricultural extension services are not as developed, however. Project villages located quite close to the main towns and government offices have not received any visits from extension officers, due to resource limitations as well as restrictions on their travel. This explains why many villages were previously unaware of the newer, higher yielding varieties of corn and paddy, which are relatively common and proven in other parts of Myanmar.

ER 4: Water and Sanitation

Replicable models for safe and reliable domestic water & sanitation systems collaboratively developed and implemented by VDO with support of partner organisations

Water supplies have generated benefits to villagers in terms of livelihoods and health/hygiene, as well as productivity through less time spent in collection. Overall, 46 water system management plans have been developed. Villages report significant reductions in time spent collecting water for women and children, and the collection itself is safer. One village visited by the Review noted that they were now busy 'all year round' with water available for agriculture, while women of one village said that time saved in collecting water could be spent on more productive activities in the household.

The project was able to fund the construction of water supply systems in 13 selected villages, while 29 villages received rainwater tanks. Following construction, water supply systems are maintained by villagers using common funds, raised from household contributions. As noted above, in some villages, management committees have decided to waive contributions or allow for labour contributions in lieu for the poorest households. Committees did mention that collection of contributions is one of their biggest challenges. It is considered that the increasing presence of users (especially women) on committees will increase ownership and therefore assist in resolving some of these problems. In one village (in Okay cluster), groups of around 10 households are given responsibility for maintaining the nearest tap stand. In another village, contributions are assessed against the number of people in the household.

The Review found that the project had introduced a number of innovative water solutions – including the use of slow sand filters to reduce sedimentation, and the installation of a Hydrum pumping system in one village (see box). In Kayan Tharyar village, the project is attempting to solve a major problem of calcification, which had caused a previous donor-funded water supply system to fail. The technology involved in some of these cases requires a certain amount of training and knowledge, as well as regular maintenance from outside technicians. Where there are obvious benefits to households, it is likely that common funds and contributions will be readily available. Where benefits (in reducing collection times, for example) are not as significant, there may not be sufficient motivation to contribute or undertake repairs

and maintenance. This is particularly so in villages where the improved water supply is limited to household drinking water only, or is seasonal. In Pan Pet, for example, the 20 rainwater tanks are fully operational only in the wet season, and even then households are restricted to a quota. At the beginning of the dry season, water from the tanks is used for emergencies only, and villagers have to resort to their traditional collection methods. The Review recommends that the project (perhaps through the partners/associates) continue to monitor these systems over the 12 months following the end of the project.

Water is fundamental to other project activities, for example:

- The process of planning, construction and use of water supply systems has been one of the most important activities for strengthening village organizations
- Home gardening, which requires a year round supply of sufficient water delivered to households
- Hygiene and health programs also require water at households for cleaning, bathing etc

Water Innovation

The villages of Kun Nar Upper and Kun Nar Lower are located 30 km northeast of Loikaw, and have limited access along an unsealed road. Water has been an acute problem in the upper village, and the project has assisted with the construction of some rainwater tanks. In the lower village, a pumping and reticulation system has been installed. This system is based on a Hydrum, a pump that uses water pressure to lift water to the holding tank in the village. The Hydrum does not require electricity, which in any case is not available. The water source is located reasonably close to the village, in a small forest, and has a good year round supply. A second Hydrum is being installed to supply another holding tank. A technician in Taunggyi (Shan State) is available to repair the system if required.

The water 'solution' used by the project is innovative although perhaps untested over a long period in an environment such as Kun Nar. The challenge for the village will be to operate and maintain the system without direct project support. The benefits of improved water supply are felt mainly by women, so the inclusion of women on the water committee will assist in sustainability, as will the training of a larger group of villagers in maintenance. Even so, a concern was expressed that sometimes the right people were not available when a problem with the system occurred. A further risk is that the advantages provided by the water system are not as significant when compared to other locations – a viable water source is located close to Kun Nar – and hence the villagers may not be motivated to repair the Hydrum system if it breaks down or costs a lot of money to replace. If successful, the Hydrum could be a useful demonstration of an effective low-level technology and its application for other locations in Kayah, and perhaps more widely in Myanmar.

The Review believes that the project's approach to water supply has been sound, plans are well designed and the technical solutions are appropriate. The 'replicable models' mentioned in the Expected Result have two elements:

- A technical solution appropriate to the village, and
- A management approach that creates ownership and sustainability, both financial and technical

The project as learned through implementation that management of water systems must include household users, and that methods for collection of contributions and plans for ongoing maintenance need to be developed in conjunction with villagers.

Given the importance of water and the integrating nature of water activities, it is recommended that future projects, such as DAU, adopt a natural resources/water systems model at the earliest stage of village level planning. This will provide for a better appreciation of what the project can provide in relation to household water supply, and the types of activities in agriculture that can be supported. In many villages, home gardens are not appropriate, for example, as sufficient quantities of water will not be available. This planning method will also give villagers a more realistic set of expectations. As part of planning, cross visits could be organized for villagers to witness what occurred under PROGRESS in similar locations to their own.

Indicator	Rating	Comments/Assessment
10 examples of positive indigenous practices identified in technical survey by end of Y2	Partly achieved	Three examples identified – original target was overly optimistic
5 replicable Water & Sanitation practices identified in the course of model development by EOP	Partly achieved	See above
25 water system management plans prepared by EOP	Exceeded	46 village water management plans prepared and operational
50% of households engaged in implementing improved water and sanitation systems by EOP	Exceeded	Almost 100 per cent household coverage by fly proof latrines, and all villages are benefiting from improved water management. Increases in household productivity and income have been observed. Water collection is safer and supplies are more secure.
5 small scale water catchments of village ponds rehabilitated by EOP	Exceeded	3 gravity flow systems completed 10 pumping systems completed 120 rainwater tanks completed in 29 villages One pond renovation completed, and minor improvements to a number of others Assistance with catchment protection initiated in a number of locations, and included in water management plans
75 persons graduated in operation and maintenance training by EOP	Exceeded	141 community members have received training in construction, operations and maintenance, water management committees with user representation and common funds operating
5 operation and maintenance manuals documented by EOP	Achieved	Water operations and maintenance manuals and information sheets produced and distributed to partners, associates and villages
A set of reference and training modules on water operation and maintenance developed to be included in the project training manual	Achieved	VDOs and water TMCs all have access to, and copies of, project manuals and training materials produced.

ER 5: Health Services

Health status of targeted vulnerable communities improved

The Review found that the project has contributed to improved health conditions across the target villages, and has significantly reduced the risks from common

diseases such as malaria and diarrhea, and improved household productivity through reducing days lost from illness. Independent purchase of bed nets and soap indicates that behaviour changes are sustainable beyond the end of the project. Further, common funds for health mean that volunteers can maintain and replenish first aid and maternal safe delivery kits.

Villages without a health center or easy access to hospitals appreciated the value of first aid kits. Villagers mentioned the use of ORS in stabilizing child patients – whereas in the past several children had died, now immediate treatment is available and serious cases referred to health services. VHVs are keen to continue in their roles and to conduct health awareness and education sessions, sometimes on a monthly basis. It is not apparent if the project partners and associates have the technical knowledge to support them in the future, so it may be more effective to develop programs in conjunction with the health department.

Accessing Health Services

The village of Pan Pet is located around 20 km from Demosoe, and access is difficult via an unsealed road. Every month, a health department midwife visits the village to check on maternal and child health. One of her tasks is to administer vaccines for children (typically BCG, DPT, measles, polio). Before the project, very few children in the village had been immunized. This is because most mothers in the village were unaware of the benefits of the procedure, and the previous experience of some children who had received the vaccines, where they came out with fevers and other reactions, led people to distrust the idea of immunization.

Training of village health volunteers under the project included immunization, and the volunteers were able to use the training materials and information to conduct awareness sessions for village mothers. The health department does not have the capacity or the resources to provide health education, and many government officials are not allowed to travel to locations such as Pan Pet. The project and the village volunteers worked with the health department midwife so that on her subsequent visits, mothers and their children were ready and available to receive vaccinations. Now, all children in Pan Pet are immunized, and the community has noted their improved health.

The project has also facilitated other health education and prevention activities, notably facilitating immunization days with the health department. This has led to an increase in immunization coverage (see box above). Other links with the health department have included VHVs referring cases of TB and malaria¹². It is clear that health education and first aid training provided by the project, has not displaced but has added value to government health services. As with other line agencies, the health department has limited resources for, or is otherwise prevented from, delivering services in the target villages.

Indicator	Rating	Comments/Assessment
300 VHVs trained for health education activities by EOP	Achieved	Training includes health education, behaviour change intervention, first aid and emergency preparedness planning, as well as engagement with health services (referrals, immunization)
3,750 HH trained in preventive health by VHVs	Exceeded	All households (4,365) participated in preventive health education and training activities, behaviour change

¹² NB: CARE also supplies VHVs with malaria test kits through the 3D Fund.

by EOP		communication sessions delivered to 2,814 households.
3301 impregnated mosquito nets distributed and in use by EOP	Exceeded	3,704 bed nets distributed – additional nets being purchased by households. Significant decrease in malaria, and cases being referred by VHVs to health department.
2861 fly proof latrines constructed and in use by EOP	Exceeded	2,695 latrines constructed, additional ones are planned for remaining households. Households also received personal hygiene kits, with replacement soap being purchased independently by households. Villages report behaviour change and resultant decrease in diseases such as diarrhea.
51 micro-plans for health activities formulated by VHT by EOP	Achieved	43 plans developed, corresponding to the 43 village health committees operational in the 51 villages. Common funds established to maintain first aid and safe delivery kits.
90% of HH encouraged to immunise their children encouraged by EOP	Achieved	Immunization rates reported as between 94 – 98 per cent for the range of children's vaccines.
A set of reference and training modules on health education developed to be included in the project training manual	Achieved	VDOs, health TMCs and VHVs all have access to, and copies of, project manuals and training materials produced

ER 6: Social Networks

Flexible networks to foster active collaboration and learning between Village Development Organisations, partner organisations and other key stakeholders established and supported

The project has managed to operate in both Loikaw and Demosoe without major disruption to activities. Relations with the government at state level are good, and this has facilitated travel permits. Participation by line agency staff in activities (for example livestock and health) has further consolidated relations, and will lead to sustainable activities following the end of the project. The project initiated a number of joint activities with all four partners/associates as part of a strategy to develop linkages.

The use of cross-visits and demonstrations has been a successful form of dissemination for agriculture, water and sanitation and health. Additional benefits of cross-visits are that they often involve joint activities between villages, and include staff of the project associates. Many villages remarked on the connections that have been established with other villages, with suppliers of seed, fertilisers and pesticides and access to government services such as animal vaccination and children's immunisation. As noted in ER 4, cross visits to PROGRESS villages will give participating villages in DAU a more realistic assessment of resources available and assist in their planning process.

Relations between project partners and associates have improved, through regular monthly meetings and activities such as joint monitoring visits and participation in cross visits. DAU presents another opportunity to build and extend this network (see ER 1). At present, Action Contre La Faim (ACF) also convenes a monthly coordination meeting of agencies implementing projects in Kayah – including CARE, World Vision and UNDP. The Review believes that linking the partners and associates with development agencies through a broader 'Kayah Development Forum' is more sustainable, especially if it could be convened (perhaps on a rotating basis) by the locally based organisations. The Forum could be a mechanism, not just for project coordination, but also for education and training, mutual learning, advocacy with government and increasing community awareness of development issues.

Indicator	Rating	Comments/Assessment
53 of cross learning visits organised at village level and at township level by EOP	Achieved	Cross learning visits are very successful mechanisms for disseminating results and encouraging participation
5 informal learning mechanisms promoted among local groups (incl. partners) and VDOs by EOP	Achieved	Impact of training can be improved through modifications along the farmer field school model proposed for DAU
3 advocacy initiatives conducted by partner organisations by EOP	Exceeded	Advocacy was a real strength of the project, and operated continuously through the implementation period, leveraging support for activities, participation by technical staff and developing sustainable links
12 documented lessons learned disseminated among partners and VDOs by EOP (one per year for each of the three technical interventions)	Exceeded	Lessons learned (23) included in training material and manuals, and highlighted during cross visits
9 development models including approaches, strategies, and methodologies promoted through social networks by EOP	Achieved	10 models and courses on facilitation, communication, leadership, bookkeeping and conflict management produced for use by partners, associates and village committees
A set of reference and training modules on facilitation, team building, and conflict resolution developed to be included in the project training manual	Achieved	Project partners and associates, VDOs and TMCs all have access to, and copies of, project manuals and training materials produced.

3.5 Project Management

The Review found that project management has been efficient and effective. The location of the project office in Loikaw was based on security and access reasons, and has not prevented project staff from delivering activities in Demosoe. However, it is noted by the Review that a training centre and warehouse has been established in Demosoe for the DAU project, and training will take place there instead of Loikaw. This is a good decision.

Field staff are all recruited locally, which has helped in operations, as they are usually not required to obtain permits before working in their assigned villages. There are good relations between the project and partners/associates, and a good understanding of project aims and objectives by senior management of CKL, KBA and KHB. This has made the handover process easier. There are no overlap issues with other projects, and in fact other development agencies are frequently reliant on CARE for advice and experience in working in Kayah.

Financial management has been, on the whole, good. Currently there is some minor under spending of project funds. However it was mentioned to the Review that the project office is examining ways of using these funds to address some ongoing sustainability issues. However, the Review was informed that funds could only be used until December 2008, and with an overall expenditure of 99 per cent, it was unlikely that any funds would be available during 2009 for additional oversight of items like water supply. The ongoing presence of CARE in Loikaw, however, will allow for some monitoring of systems installed as part of PROGRESS Kayah.

The monitoring and evaluation system used by the project has been improved during the project period, at the behest of CARE's Yangon head office. The new system improved the quality of reporting from field level. The Review notes that the project has an excellent data collection system, village site information is readily available

and reports are generally of a good standard. The Review believes that involving project partners and associates in delivery, and improving their capacity for management and monitoring and evaluation, can be extended through their participation in the DAU project.

4. Lessons Learned

In a conflict-affected area such as Kayah, long-term development projects such as PROGRESS may be too ambitious unless they have built on the experiences of previous projects. The Emergency Nutrition project allowed CARE to understand the operational situation in Kayah, develop appropriate models of implementation and (perhaps most importantly), address government advocacy, security and access problems. This assisted PROGRESS, and allowed for expansion into Demosoe, which is being further extended through DAU. Staged implementation is a strategy that has wider application in other areas affected by conflict or with access difficulties.

However, some project staff noted that the transition from the Emergency Nutrition Project to PROGRESS meant that some villages and communities had needs that were not met. It is therefore important that project design and implementation takes into account all needs of the communities involved, and that the transition between projects is undertaken in full consultation with communities. This will ensure that 'gaps' in addressing high priority needs do not occur.

The original three-year period for PROGRESS allowed for scheduling activities in 51 villages in two townships with a relatively small number of project staff. Reliance on volunteers (from partners/associates and villages) meant that activities could be carried on without direct project intervention. This is an effective approach where access is difficult and travel is not always permissible.

Due to limited participation in activity planning and limited understanding of the project design, some key staff from partner organizations were not able to fully participate in events such as the Mid Term Review. This was discussed during the evaluation as well as in the DAU inception workshop. Increasing the capacity of partner organizations will also strengthen their participation in future activities of this type.

Good advocacy with government enable PROGRESS to remain mostly on schedule. Establishing relations with, and involving line agencies in specific activities, was an important factor in awareness raising, building credibility and avoiding further problems.

Where villages have had very little previous experience of collective approaches, projects such as PROGRESS can make positive changes to village governance. Involvement in decisions on project activities, coupled with training in areas such as management, rights and responsibilities, communication skills, running meetings, bookkeeping has had a significant impact. Involvement of women is especially important to ensure effectiveness of activities in water supply, health and household income generation.

Where government services are lacking, projects such as PROGRESS can act as catalysts for improving access. In PROGRESS, this involved providing initial education and awareness, mobilizing village committees and involving selected line agencies in project activities. Rather than duplicating services, the project can establish sustainable links with existing service providers. This was particularly effective for children's immunization and for livestock vaccination.

In agriculture, the benefits of training result from new skills and capacities, rather than learning about specific crops. Farmers make decisions based on an assessment of risk and returns to their households, and providing information to

make this assessment should be an important element of any project-based assistance.

Access to water is a crucial factor in many rural livelihoods projects. The amount of water available on a year round basis will determine what sorts of project activities can be implemented. An assessment of natural resources, with a focus on water, at an early stage will improve selecting, planning and prioritizing project activities, and increase long-term sustainability of interventions.

Water supply 'models' have to include both an appropriate technical and an appropriate management solution for the particular village site. These need to be developed in conjunction with representative community bodies (e.g. water user groups) to ensure long term maintenance and financial sustainability.

The availability of capital for farming households is always a problem. Solutions such as micro-finance are not always appropriate in remote rural areas, and tend to involve individual borrowers. The creation of common funds has assisted households to reduce seasonal debt, as well as providing village committees with sufficient funds to cover higher costs, such as repairs and maintenance of water infrastructure and equipment.

The project benefitted from having a field office presence in Kayah – in terms of advocacy with local authorities, proximity to field activities and support for project partners. As well, the office had good links with CARE Yangon to engage additional resources for monitoring and evaluation and financial management. In an area such as Kayah with access and operational difficulties, international organizations will require a presence 'on the ground' to ensure maximum effectiveness and efficiency of project implementation.